

Reducing Emissions from Deforestation and Forest Degradation (REDD)+: Other Name of [Capitalist] Illusion

Nuruddin Al Akbar

Politics and Government Studies, Gadjah Mada University

Email: nuruddin.alakbar@gmail.com

This study seeks to offer a non conventional readings in judging Reducing Emissions from Deforestation and Forest Degradation (REDD)+. In conventional readings, REDD+ is deemed as a strategy for global environmental protection from the global warming threats. REDD+ is officially ratified as an accurate strategy to save the environment by the international community at the UN climate change conference in Cancun, Mexico. contrary to widespread support on REDD+, this study views REDD+ as a illusion, in which REDD+ does not provide a real solution for global environmental protection. As with an illusion, REDD+ is designed to strengthen the global capitalist system which stands on industrialization. The existence of industrialization is challenged because it is considered as the culprit of global environmental damage, including global warming. By the existence of REDD+, it is expected that global community will be satisfied with the solution so as to minimize suits which is fundamental for the sake of sustainable industrialization. There are two important discussions tried to be elaborated by this study. *Firstly*, elaborating REDD+ as a false solution to the climate change. The discussion in this section emphasizes on the critical study on conceptual building REDD+. *Secondly*, critical study on collaborative governance strategy, which is conventionally understood as a mean to apply REDD+ significantly. This study belongs to a qualitative research. Data collection technique used is study of documentation. Among the results showed that: 1) REDD + is an illusion because it serves only give birth to trash carbon scheme. Third world countries serves as a provider of junk land, as well as active consumers of carbon produced by industrialized countries and global corporations. On the other hand, the release of carbon committed industrialized countries and corporations continue to run as usual. So intrinsically REDD + is an illusion because it will never reach the global emissions reduction targets. 2.) Collaborative governance is an essential component required by REDD + to sustain its existence.

Keywords: REDD+, Greenhouse Gas, Politics of Disneyland, Collaborative Governance

Exordium: Under the Shadow of Global REDD+ regime

The issue of climate change or more commonly referred to as the issue of global warming is one of the latest issues of concern in various circles. Ranging from international organizations like the UN, the transnational and local NGOs such as Greenpeace and WALHI, to academics in both developed and third world countries do not want to miss as to take part in discussing this issue²³.

Particularly in academic circles, the issue of global warming-including the generally idea of the environment issue- can be said that have successfully merged the various barriers of traditional knowledge which still give the impacts²⁴. Because it is proved significantly in any

²³ One of the real evidence of the actor's attention to the problems of global warming clearly manifested by the holding of a spectacular event in 1992 known as the Earth Summit. Spectacular meeting initiated by the UN managed to bring together more than 100 heads of state the world, in 2400 representatives of NGOs, including the presence of about 1400 leaders, academics and planning experts from 178 countries of the world. One result of the meeting was the creation of an international agreement related to global warming called the UNFCCC (United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change). The agreement has a great mission to stabilize greenhouse gas concentrations in the atmosphere on the stage that does not endanger the safety of mankind. See Dodds, Felix, Michael Strauss & Maurice F. Strong. 2012. *Only One Earth: The Long Road via Rio to Sustainable Development*. Abingdon: Routledge, p. 33; Cooper, C. David. 2015. *Introduction to Environmental Engineering*. Long Grove, IL: Waveland Press, p. 22; English, Mary E. 2004. Environment Risk and Justice. In McDaniels, Timothy & Mitchell Small (ed). *Risk Analysis and Society: An Interdisciplinary Characterization of the Field*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, p. 143

²⁴ Traditional science bulkhead means a rigid division in each field of study to provide clear limits regarding the entities that can be categorized as research studies in their respective fields of science. As an easy example in the study of political science which is traditionally attached to the discussion of the themes of public policy, the parliament, the bureaucracy, the constitutional system, regional autonomy (formalist, does not include the study of informal politics, such as the existence of bossism, shadow state, thugs as an actor to be reckoned). Hard to imagine a political science will examine the songs, poems, films, comics, graffiti, including science as an entity that is not neutral, filled with a certain power. The study of

disciplines, both exact science (natural science) or social sciences humanities (and philosophy), give attention to the environmental issues that are traditionally not part of their review²⁵, even academics in clumps social sciences-humanities and the philosophers involved in analyzing or giving thoughts or trying to offer solutions to contemporary environmental issues²⁶.

songs, poems, films for example, are always considered to be the realm of cultural studies, literature, or communication. Though it is possible for the political aspect (power relations) in a song, poem, or movie.

²⁵ One proof of the active involvement of social scientist in the global warming problem could be found of their involvement in the IPCC (Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change). See Salih, M.A. Mohamed . 2013. Conclusion. In Salih, M.A. Mohamed (ed). *Local Climate Change and Society*. Abingdon: Routledge,p. 201

The institute (IPCC) is considered the most authoritative by the international community in terms of analysis issued a "scientific" about climate change / global warming. See Andrew E. Dessler. 2016. *The Economics of Climate Change: Evidence*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press,p. 9; Doyle, Julie. 2011. *Mediating Climate Change*. England: Asghate,p.17

²⁶ Traditionally the environmental problem is actually more closely related to the natural sciences. However, along with the global awareness of environmental, social scientists, humanities scholars, and philosophers are able to spawn various works related to environmental issues. For example, in the study of philosophy since the 1960s emerged attention to what is often termed as ethical environment. One of the monumental works that are considered symbolizes the revival of the study of environmental ethics is the work of Richard Routley entitled *Is There A Need for a New, Environmental Ethic?* , which is published in 1973. See Pandya, Rameshwari. 2010. Introduction. In Pandya, Rameshwari (ed). *Adult and Non Formal Education*. New Delhi: Gyan Publishing House,p. 18; Palmer, Clare. Sustainability and Philosophy. In Blewitt, John & Cedric Cullingford (ed). *The Sustainability Curriculum: The Challenge for Higher Education*. London: Earthscan,p.237; Clowney, David & Patricia Mosto (ed). 2009. *Earthcare: An Anthology in Environmental Ethics*. Lanham: Rowman & Littlefield,p. 22

In addition to philosophy, social sciences such as political science also began to "glance" environmental issues as part of the study. One

Great attention from the academic world, policy makers, as well as the Civil Society Organization to the environmental issues -including global issues warming- actually is a positive thing, which continued to show a clear evidence of a global public awareness increasing since the 1960s would be a worsening of the condition of the global environment and the need to strategic steps that should be taken to overcome these problems.

The careless of the international community, including civil society groups and academics to the damage of the global environment also remains true especially its big fear among global corporations and industrialized countries as the country where the global corporations born

of the initial intersection of political science and environmental issues occurred due to the emergence of pressure groups / interests or political parties voicing environmental protection (e.g. the emergence of green parties in Europe or the emergence of groups of pacifist / anti-war in the United Kingdom in the 1970s). Over time, when environmental issues become even more "sexy" globally, a political science also expands studies on the existence of an international regime, the state policy, the existence of transnational organizations, pressure groups / interests, green party, and various other elements that have relevance to environmental issues. See Kamieniecki, Sheldon. 1993. *Emerging Forces in Global Environmental Politics*. In Kamieniecki, Sheldon (ed). *Environmental Politics in the International Arena: Movements, Parties, Organizations, and Policy*. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, p.1; Leydier, Gilles & Alexia Martin. 2013. Introduction. In Leydier, Gilles & Alexia Martin (ed). *Environmental Issues in Political Discourse in Britain and Ireland*. Newcastle Upon Tyne: Cambridge University Press, p. vii; Richardson, Dick. 1995. *The Green Challenge: Philosophical, Programmatic, and Electoral Considerations*. In Richardson, Dick & Chris Rootes (ed). *The Green Challenge: The Development of Green Parties in Europe*. London: Routledge, p. 3

As an example of the contributions of political scientists to analyze the global warming phenomenon can be found in the emergence of international environmental, political theory (the mainstream paradigm in the study of environmental politics). This theory itself rests on two ideas figure named Garret Hardin and Elinor Ostrom. See Mast, Jerald & Carthage College. 2011. *International Environmental Politics* In Ishiyama, John T & Marijke Breuning (ed). *21st Century Political Science: A Reference Handbook Volume 1*. California: SAGE, p. 441

and centered. This view is very reasonable considering the duo of actors that play an important role in the destruction of the global environment, including global climate change which becomes worse as a result of those various industrial activities that resulting the release of greenhouse gases²⁷ in large quantities since the industrial revolution in England²⁸.

The fact of the corporation's participation and the developed industrialized countries on global warming in the industrial revolution context is explicitly stated by the IPCC on their report in 2007. The report underlined the important fact about the industrial revolution relation and the release of the greenhouse gasses and this phenomenon was significantly increased in 1850²⁹. It clearly shows that the implication of the report "making bad" the corporation's name as the source of the environment pollution maker (in the context of the England government). Thus, the corporation's participation and the developed industrial country is not limited in the England industrial revolution only, but those two actors has the contribution in spreading the pollutant of the greenhouse until right now³⁰.

The developed industrialized countries and the corporation will not keep silent and let themselves become the accused for the global environmental criminal. If they do not give any nurture, the implication should be paid by these actors is very "expensive", because they have the

²⁷ Greenhouse gases are the name given to any kind of gases that affect the creation of global warming. Among such gas is carbon dioxide (CO₂) and methane. See Casper, Julie Kerr. 2010. *Greenhouse Gases: Worldwide Impacts*. New York: Fact on File,Inc,hlm. Iv

²⁸ One reason for the release of greenhouse gases in large quantities when the industrial revolution was the use of coal as a driver of industry at the time. Yet coal is the dirtiest type of fuel. Especially if its use is not controlled. See Glover, Leigh. 2006. *Postmodern Climate Change*. New York: Routledge,p.11

²⁹ Kusky, Timothy M. 2009. *Climate Change: Shifting Glaciers, Deserts, and Climate Belts*. New York: Facts on File,Inc,p. 49

³⁰ This statement is no exaggeration, which even though third world countries, now actively seek industrialization, but can not be compared to the pollution that has been generated by industrialized countries over the years. An appropriate analogy to describe this is a third world country only adds to the "water" -in small amount surely- into a pond "water" that have been there before. See Chandrappa, Ramesha,Sushil Gupta & Umesh Chandra Kulshrestha. 2011. *Coping with Climate Change: Principles and Asian Context*. Heidelberg: Springer,p. 28

responsibility to repair the nature they have been broken. The responsibilities are various, such as changing the production process which depends on the energy source which is not environmental friendly and making the pollution volume released by the industries smaller by using some special facilities³¹. These various responsibilities will decrease the profit gotten by the corporation and the developed industrialized countries without thinking of the nature damage caused by them.

Although the changing “uncertainly” will damage the capitalistic economy, but because the economical thought that has been planted in those two actors i.e. to minimize the spending and to maximize the profit, so the high spending without any profits- although it is important for the human – will not be approved. It is clear that whatever the alternative strategies which give fewer interruptions to the capitalistic will be chosen.

As the concrete evidence of the irresponsible corporations and the developed industrialized countries in the alternative strategy, it is manifested in the case of the Rachel Carson in 19960s. The case of the Carson is started from the launching of the book titled silent spring by Rachel Carson. The book which became the basic of the modern environmentalism³², talks about the DDT (Dichloro Diphenyl Trichloroethane), the chemical used as the pesticide. DDT was found in 1942-another version stated it was found in 1939-and it is used for eradicating the plant disease (insect) and insect brought disease such is typhus and malaria³³.

On his effort to shake the DDT domination in the US farming sectors, Carson selected the popular language and easy to comprehend in writing the Silent Spring. It was far from the natural formula and high

³¹ For example, in the case of industries that emit liquid waste must be ensured to have the installation of WWTP (Wastewater Treatment Plant). The goal is that the waste that ultimately discharged into the river will not have a negative impact on the environment.

³² Cronon, William. 2008. Silent Spring and The Birth of Modern Environmentalism. In Dunlap, Thomas R (ed). 2008. *DDT, Silent Spring, and the Rise of Environmentalism: Classic Texts*. Seattle: University of Washington Press,p.ix

³³ Makfoeld, Djarir et al. 2002. *Kamus Istilah Pangan Dan Nutrisi*. Yogyakarta: Kanisius,p.61; Cumo, Christopher.2015. DDT. In Ryan, James Gilbert & Leonard C Schlup (ed). *Historical Dictionary of the 1940s*. New York: Routledge,p. 100

level languages which were known by the scientist which makes society tend to agree of what scientists said about the safety of DDT³⁴. Carson stated that although DDT can kill the insect, but DDT performance is more than what has been expected. When the killed insects are consumed by other animals such as bird, the bird will be killed, too³⁵. The death of the bird becomes the Carson's icon and gives idea of his book title, *Silent Spring* because the sounds of the birds in summer has been gone because the birds were killed because of DDT. This finding showed that DDT has the strong effect and potentially damage the food chain made naturally.

Deeper, Carson gives the scarier underline that the disturbed food chain is not related to the insect and the bird only, but it is also related to the human as the part of the food chain. DDT touches the plant and then the plant is consumed by the animal such as chicken. The plant still contains of the poison of DDT although it has been absorbed by the chicken. The chicken consumed those plant is contaminated by DDT, including the eggs. The eggs are consumed by the human. When consumer of the eggs is a woman, the poison of the DDT still exist and the woman is contaminated. When she becomes a mother, her breast is also contaminated³⁶. The contamination of the DDT on human can bring the disease such as cancer and genetic disorder³⁷.

The surprising conclusion made by Carson about DDT created the big controversy as fast in US. One of the parties caviled Carson loudest come from industrial parties. Robert White Stephens, as the speaker of the industrial parties said that Carson's book was not supported by the scientific evidences. He doubted the Carson's academic background³⁸. Actually, the protest delivered by Stephens can be received because the book of Carson is the "arrow" shouted to the heart of the US corporations produced DDT. But the protest did not have the foundation because Carson had several relevant scientific finding on his book. Besides,

³⁴ *Ibid*,p.108

³⁵ Housel, Debra J. 2008. *Pioneering Ecologists*. Huntington Beach, CA: Teacher Created Materials Publishing,p.13

³⁶ Derr, Patrick George & Edward M. McNamara. 2003. *Case Studies in Environmental Ethics*. Rowman & Littlefield Publishing Group, Inc,p.164; Petersen, Christine. 2011. *Protecting Earth's Food Supply*. Singapore: Marshal Candevish Corporation,p.62

³⁷ Joseph, Benny. 2006. *Environmental Studies*. Delhi: Tata Mc Graw Hill,p.4

³⁸ Moore, Colleen F. 2003. *Silent Scourge: Children, Pollution, and Why Scientists Disagree*. New York: Oxford,p.120

Carson also took a school in the Biology education major on the John Hopkins University (his Master degree)³⁹.

In addition to criticism of the industries, the skeptical reaction also appeared from the US government. It is recorded many US government agencies still refuse to stop the use of DDT controversy after Carson's work appeared⁴⁰. The US Justice also showed the same negative attitude towards the work of Carson. A number of efforts by environmental activists who inspired the work of Carson for an urgent ban on the use of DDT in some areas of the United States through the courts ended in failure. One of the cases occurred in the Wisconsin. Judge in the region did not accept the arguments of environmental activists and cut the presentation made during the trial. The results of the trial can be unpredictable, move to outlaw which was not sanctioned court⁴¹. A similar incident occurred in the area of Michigan. The court's decision did give a delay to the use of pesticides, but the record until "the right time". The court also did not prohibit its use⁴².

The case of Carson above shows an important fact of existence duet of the corporations-developed industrialized countries forward to block the work of Carson in order to make Carson did not to get a place in the hearts of American society in particular. Of course, any beneficial corporate strategy will be used, including attacks on the credibility of the Carson's academic, sued Scientifics books he wrote, or even using the hands of the state to ensure that harmful use of DDT remain stable. Certainly in the case of global warming such an alternative strategy will also be used by the corporation and the advanced industrialized countries that threatened its interests if made fundamental changes to the world environmental governance.

Based on the belief in global environmental awareness as the basic strategies barrier that jeopardize the interests of corporations and the developed industrialized countries, the research on REDD + is implemented. Due to the emergence of REDD + itself cannot be separated from the interference of the corporation. This research is about to perform critical analyzes of the conception of Reducing Emissions from Deforestation and Forest Degradation (REDD) + increasingly obtain an echo in various international forums and discussion in

³⁹ *Ibid*

⁴⁰ Davis, Frederick Rowe. 2014. *Banned: A History of Pesticides and the Science of Toxicology*. London: Yale University Press, p. 188

⁴¹ *Ibid*

⁴² *Ibid*

academic circles today⁴³. REDD + itself considered as the most effective strategy in order to face the dangers of global warming is more pronounced for men⁴⁴. Critical reading question in this research is to sue the conception readings that tend to argue that as the notion of normative and non interest⁴⁵.

In contrast to these readings, the researchers looked at REDD+ as a much nuanced political conception, and deserve to be called as a technology of power. It is called as the technology for true power of this idea secretly loaded with a particular interest (in this case the interests of global corporations and industrialized countries), which in essence did not correlate with a reduction in global gas emissions which is essential.

The study itself will be centered on two discussions, namely: 1) Dismantling REDD + building concept that claim to be able to contribute positively to the reduction the global greenhouse gas emissions. 2)

⁴³ According to the study CIFOR (Center for International Forestry Research), an institution that has the attention to forest management in third world countries, along with the fame concept of REDD + globally, almost every day appeared conversations regarding REDD, either in the form of articles, reports or statements. See Angelsen, Arild & Stibniati Atmadja. 2010. Buku ini tentang apa? In Angelsen, Arild & Stibniati Atmadja (ed). *Melangkah Maju Dengan REDD Isu, Pilihan Dan Implikasi*. Bogor Barat: CIFOR, p.3

⁴⁴ OECD. 2015. *Development Co-operation Report 2015: Making Partnerships Effective Coalitions for Action*. Paris: OECD Publishing, p. 152

⁴⁵ Among examples of the mainstream view that puts the idea of REDD + as a non interests and neutral for example can be seen in the writings of Jacob Sese Emilianus Tolo. Tolo is a researcher in the Master of Public Administration, University of Gadjah Mada, as well as REDD + Project Manager, University of Gadjah Mada. According to Tolo, REDD + is a conception that will benefit the third world countries (specifically Indonesia, which has a tropical forest), both ecologically and economically. Throughout his writings Tolo showed no critical stance on the concept of REDD + Analysis of Critical done by Tolo lies only in the analysis of the factors to impede the implementation of REDD + in Indonesia (Central Maluku). As a solution to these obstacles, Tolo suggests doing decentralization of forest of the Indonesian government. See Emilianus Yakob Sese Tolo. 2012. Signifikansi Desentralisasi Kehutanan Bagi Implementasi REDD+ di Kabupaten Maluku Tengah. In *Jurnal Ilmu Sosial dan Ilmu Politik* Volume 16, No 2, p. 154, 164-165

Analyzing critically why so many global actors both countries, civil society organizations, academia, to the indigenous people get interested in the idea of REDD + which is ultimately does not contribute essentially to save the global environment from the dangers of global warming? This section focuses on the study to examine critically the impressions of the illusion projected by the REDD + so as to "enchant" many people to participate and collaborate to make REDD + program success in various parts of the world. In particular this section will highlight collaborative governance strategy that also serves as an important technology in the power of illusion REDD +.

CONCEPTS AND METHODS

Political Disneyland as an instrument to understand the nature of REDD +

In the interests of research that seeks to understand the REDD + critically, where the idea is nothing but an illusion created to prevent a lawsuit fundamental to the corporation and the developed industrialized countries, then it is very appropriate to refer to the political conception of Disneyland developed by two contemporary thinkers named Umberto Eco and Jean Baudrillard. It should be emphasized here that the two men as far as I know never used the political term of Disneyland. Moreover, the idea of two of the figures implicitly can be read as a form of sophisticated political strategy that can be used for the success of particular interest.

Related to the view toward Disneyland, the two men have a common ground at the same point about the nature of the enemies of Disneyland itself. In the perspective of Eco, Disneyland is a real manifestation of postmodern culture that characterizes fake (imitation)⁴⁶. Disneyland offers a mix between that fact with fiction, but it is packaged in a concept that is so amazing that visitors will be spoiled with treats and attractions that can be said to be more real, more riveting, and attract more visitors than watching something original⁴⁷.

For example easy to understand what was mentioned by Eco, it can be watched carefully in the Figure 1 which illustrates one attraction owned by Disneyland.

⁴⁶ Lister, Martin et al. 2009. *New Media: A Critical Introduction*. Abingdon: Routledge, p. 138

⁴⁷ Julier, Guy. 2008. *The Culture of Design*. London: SAGE, p. 153



Source: Silvia, 2014

Picture 1. Crocodile sightings as one attraction offered by Disneyland

The figure shows a crocodile and tiger behind that was tearing the fabric or material may take in the surrounding areas. What are the important points of attraction? The answer is that the attractions of reality show something that is expected to be obtained by a visitor Disneyland. As it was in the minds of many people who often saw the event on television, movies, or documentaries about the lives of crocodiles "malignant", "cruel", and "wild" then when a visitor enters Disneyland, dreams of seeing reality of some sort that they are pursuing to obtained. To get that kind of visualization they willingly dug deep their money.

The question is whether that kind of thing does not come from something genuine or real, for example, from the zoo? The answer is often yes. How often someone visitor when looking at every native animals in zoos (including Indonesia) but seemed to swallow deep disappointment because when he got in such a place does not get a treat or a spectacle that is expected of them. For instance if we see an alligator, it is seen that crocodile often in a state of silence, calm, do not move at all. A reality that is actually normal for crocodiles do not eat every second. Crocodile excessive aggressiveness, if happen, also certainly be a problem for the security of visitors.

Surely this kind of situation cannot be presented by the zoo, but it can be presented by Disneyland. In the context of Disneyland, visitors can experience the awe encounter with wild animals or even other characters like pirates, fictional characters that feels very real. Such encounters with wild animals like crocodiles "malignant" or tiger behind that seemed so wild and ready to pounce on anyone who approached. Visitors do not have to worry about these animals will escape and attack them because they themselves understand that animals there are artificial course, which is designed specifically to entertain visitors.

Through the case crocodile Disneyland above (which is also used as an example by Eco), it shows that Disneyland (technology-based) capable of producing reality "artificial" reality exceeds the original (natural) itself. Reality "clones" the result of advanced technology that is actually desired by visitors⁴⁸. So it is not wrong to say that the illusion which is presented Disneyland is not just an illusion, but an illusion that is able to meet the sophisticated deep desire to be a reality envisioned by the dream garden visitors⁴⁹.

An important point of Eco's thought about Disneyland is Disneyland as a fantastic illusion created to divert public attention from the real thing, and pulled into the "magic" charms Disneyland. Of course the end of this charm is used to draw the maximum profit from the people who visit it. The public that is fascinated by the "magic" Disneyland will continuously conduct consumer behavior during a visit to Disneyland. So it is accurately stated that Disneyland as the real ideology of consumerism representation⁵⁰.

In contrast to Eco, Baudrillard stated that the essence of Disneyland is not in the charm that makes people prefer a hoax like Disney compared to reality, because it felt Disneyland offers a "reality" that is "more real". According to Baudrillard, actually Disneyland hide a more sinister vested interests that hide the fact that the entire US is the real Disneyland⁵¹.

⁴⁸ In the language of Eco: *"Disneyland not only produce illusion, but – in confessing it- stimulates the desire for it..."*. See eco, Umberto. 1986. *Travels in Hyperreality*. Florida: Houghton Mifflin Harcourt,p. 44. See also: Salecl, Renata. *The State as A Work of Art: The Trauma of Ceausescu's Disneyland*. In Leach, Neil (ed). *Architecture and Revolution: Contemporary Perspectives on Central and Eastern Europe*. London: Routledge,p. 106

⁴⁹ This is what makes Baudrillard considers, that in the context of Disneyland, the technology is able to provide the reality of "artificial" more "real" than the original (natural). See Morris, David B. 1998. *Illness and Culture in the Postmodern Age*. London: University of California Press,p. 219

⁵⁰ Kolas, Ashild. 2008. *Tourism and Tibetan Culture in Transition: A Place Called Shangrila*. Abingdon: Routledge,p. 35

⁵¹ Lenhard, Johannes. 2011. *Hyperreal Obscenities - Baudrillard on Cybersex*. Norderstedt: GRIN Verlag,p. 3; Abarrio, Rubén Peinado. 2014. *Learning To Be American: Richard Ford's Frank Bascombe Trilogy and the Construction of A National Identity*. Valencia: Universitat de València,p. 134

It is important to be noticed, the meaning of Baudrillard's statement above, which for Baudrillard, Disneyland offers a reality that can easily be perceived by visitors as something unreal. For example visitors can see various attractions in the past or fictional characters which are certainly it were not materializing in practice. Such a way of thinking is actually deceptive, because when they get out of Disneyland they think that what is outside the park complex that dream is entirely real. Yet according to Baudrillard, US soil is desert hyperreality, where the reality and fiction is mixed into one. US citizens treated to Disneyland when they will feel able to distinguish clearly which of fiction in which the truth, so when facing the reality of the US non Disneyland they will look at it all is a reality instead of hyper reality⁵².

The simple example to illustrate the logic of falsehood try made by Disneyland is the case in prison⁵³. When someone see prisoners huddled behind bars-as were most evident in movies or television-show depicted a person who loses his freedom. Every day he had to curl up in a narrow cell in a certain time, after which he had to undergo prison routine, and end with a curled back to live his days in prison until his term ends. When looking at such a reality soon people can be fooled into thinking he was free, because to understand it as the lack of freedom in the holding cell⁵⁴. In fact, very likely-and this might imagine Baudrillard

⁵² Rubenstein, Diane. 2010. America. In Smith, Richard G. (ed). *The Baudrillard Dictionary*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press,p. 12; Norris, Trevor. 2011. *Consuming Schools: Commercialism and the End of Politics*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press,p. 130-131

⁵³ Baudrillard himself used the analogy of prison. See Saleh-Hanna, Viviane. 2008. *Colonial Systems of Control: Criminal Justice in Nigeria*. Ottawa. University of Ottawa Press,p. 246

⁵⁴ An interesting example that can destroy the deceptive perceptions, for example, many states of the real factory workers suffer more than the life of a prisoner. They are employed in a very long time with a minimum salary. If workers tried to resist, they soon can be fired and replaced by other workers. This kind of life certainly cannot be called "freedom", even more appropriately called slavery. The labor melancholy story does not only happen in third world countries, but also a country that claims to champion freedom, namely the US. The life of the various workers in the country (especially forced labor) is very grievous, such as treated arbitrarily, or work under very poor conditions. For example see: Free the Slaves& Human Right Center. 2004. *HIDDEN SLAVES Forced Labor in*

happen- people who think they are actually in a state free is not free too, only he was not aware of himself⁵⁵.

Two different perspectives about Disneyland that will be the important guidelines for reading REDD + in this study. Specifically this research field put the two ways which are not as contradictory, but rather complementary. Disneyland can be said that it is as an illusion, has a variety of functions needed by specific interests⁵⁶. In the context of REDD +, it is actually two sides separately illusions envisioned by Baudrillard and Eco present and united that would have such great effect in influencing audiences. Of course, in the context of political science, who is holding the power of the REDD + technology course he will be able to realize the benefit of its covert easily. The strategy of the true power of this kind of right is labeled as politic of Disneyland.

Related to the type and data collection method used in this study, it can be said that this research is classified as a qualitative research with a focus study of critical analysis of REDD + which is based on the footing knife political analysis of Disneyland, while the data collection method is fully relying on the model of the literature review research, because the resources used in the research are entirely based on the relevant literature, including books, articles, journals. It should also be added that the level of the data analysis, before moving to analyze the data based on the political Disneyland, an indispensable first step to be undertaken is to identify why REDD + is only an illusion, not a fact. In this section, it needs explanation affirming that REDD + is not correlated with the reduction of greenhouse gas emissions globally.

DISCUSSION

The other side of the REDD +: Critical Review on Noel Kempff Mercado Climate Action Project (NKCAP)

Tracking the history of REDD + raises a gigantic project name held in Bolivia as the beginning of the birth of REDD + called Noel

the United States. Washington, D.C & Berkeley: Free the Slaves & Human Right Center, p. 5

⁵⁵ Lane, Richard J. 2009. *Jean Baudrillard*. Abingdon: Routledge, p. 87

⁵⁶ For example in Eco terms, Disneyland serves as a disguised supermarket where the buyer buys obsessively. In other words, being a Shopaholic. See Champbell, Neil. 2005. *Producing America: Redefining Post-Tourism in Global Media Age*. In Crouch, David, Rhona Jackson & Felix Thompson (ed). *The Media and the Tourist Imagination: Converging Cultures*. Abingdon: Routledge, p. 207

Kempff Mercado Climate Action Project (NKCAP)⁵⁷. So it can be said that NKCAP is a prototype of REDD +. NKCAP itself has a mission to protect the endangered tropical forests in the region of Santa Cruz⁵⁸. It is expected that the success of NKCAP in protecting tropical forests will be obtained two great advantages interrelated. First, the protected forests will contribute in carbon sequestration, thus reducing global warming potential⁵⁹. Conversely, if the forest is not maintained, due to the phenomenon of deforestation in the region, the function of carbon sequestration will be lost, and certainly have a negative impact for the improvement of the global climate. Secondly, ecologically saving the forest will keep the area very rich in biodiversity in it⁶⁰.

As a solution to save the tropical forests, NKCAP designed a strategy for forest conservation which is quite interesting. At least two big ideas in forest conservation project are designed by NKCAP namely: first, maintaining the existence of forests as the carbon sinks. The strategy is by compensation that logging activities stopped. In addition to increase the security of the protected area, the national park boundaries were expanded⁶¹. Of course it also allows the expansion of the absorption of carbon by forests increases. Secondly, the introduction of environmentally friendly economic activities in surrounding communities, including ecotourism. Economic activity environmentally friendly is important to ensure the citizens who had previously received income from the forest penetrated -for example- it did not return to encroachment elsewhere, or prevent their activities potentially damaging to the environment such as agricultural activity⁶².

⁵⁷ Cecilia Van Zyl & Godwell Nhamo. 2011. Financing REDD+ in Africa. In Nhamo, Godwell (ed). *Green Economy and Climate Mitigation: Topics of Relevance to Africa*. Pretoria: Africa Institute of South Africa, p. 167

⁵⁸ Cottle, Phil & Charles Crostwaite Eyre. 2002. Insuring Forest Sinks. In Bishop, Joshua & Stefano Pagiola (ed). *Selling Forest Environmental Services: Market-Based Mechanisms for Conservation and Development*. Abingdon: EarthScan, p. 251

⁵⁹ *Ibid*

⁶⁰ *Ibid*

⁶¹ Trexler, M, L. Kosloff & R. Gibbons. 1999. Overview of Forestry and land Use Projects Pursued under the Pilot. In Dixon, Robert K. (ed). *The U.N. Framework Convention on Climate Change Activities Implemented Jointly (AJI) Pilot: Experiences and Lesson Learned*. Dordrecht: Springer, p. 130

⁶² *Ibid*

Since it is run in 1997, NKCAP is claimed great success with the ability to prevent carbon emissions by 1 million tons of CO₂ commencing in 2005⁶³. It is estimated that with the signing of the contract for 30 years NKCAP project estimates 6 million tons of CO₂ can be reduced⁶⁴, thereby it contributes very positively to the improvement of global environmental security.

An interesting finding from the project tracking is The Nature Conservancy (TNC) as the main actor, coupled with British Petroleum, PacifiCorp and American Electric Power as a founding of the project investment⁶⁵. From the study of actors involved, it can smell suspicions regarding the project. For example, American Electric Power⁶⁶ is known as a corporation that is not friendly to the environment because it prioritizes the use of coal as a source of their power plants⁶⁷. Yet coal is the dirtiest source of energy compared with other energy sources⁶⁸. So it can be suspected NKCAP -which later became REDD + - no more a strategy of "washing hands" environmentally unfriendly corporate sort of American Electric Power to create a new image of environmental friendliness⁶⁹. It is a very promising strategy in the global world awareness of the importance of saving the environment.

⁶³ GEF & UNCCD. 2011. *Land for Life: Securing Our Common Future*. Washington D.C: Global Environment Facility,p. 171

⁶⁴ *Ibid*

⁶⁵ Robertson, Nina & Sven Wunder. 2005. *Fresh Tracks in the Forest: Assessing Incipient Payments for Environmental Services Initiatives in Bolivia*. Jakarta: CIFOR,p. 18

⁶⁶ The American Electric company listed as the largest energy company in the US. .See Goodell, Jeff. 2006. *Big Coal: The Dirty Secret Behind America's Energy Future*. New York: Houghton Mifflin Harcourt, p. 110

⁶⁷ National Research Council. No date. *Informing an Effective Response to Climate Change*. Washington D.C: National Academies Press,p. 109

⁶⁸ Rashid, Muhammad H. 2015. *Alternative Energy in Power Electronics*. Oxford: Butterworth-Heinemann,p. 89

⁶⁹ With the release of the Investor Responsibility Research Center, American Electric Power (AEP) claimed to have done much in an effort to save the environment, including contributing to reducing greenhouse gas emissions. NKCAP claimed as an example of the success of AEP to reduce greenhouse gas emissions. See Investor Responsibility Research Center. 2004. *Profile on American Electric Power*. p. 7. Accessed in

In addition to the problematic funding, the project actor of TNC also is not far from the criticism. It is recorded that TNC ever conducted projects in Indonesia. The project is known as the Kruger National Park (KNP). Jehan Cypri Paju Dale conducts critical analysis of TNC and TNK involvement in the project and gets the surprising conclusion. TNC involvement in the project of TNK was started since 2003, where the government decided to privatize the management of TNK and submitted by PT Putri Naga Komodo (PT TNK). The share owned by TNK is owned largely by the TNC⁷⁰. Mastery of separation by the TNC is being the beginning of the agency's involvement in the setting of TNK.

Since the setting of TNK regulated by PT TNK (TNC), it was raised various discourses that seemed so encouraging the dragon lovers and people who care about the welfare. Among the discourse that is stocked is the takeover / management of TNK by TNC and PT TNK successfully tackled the environmental damage caused by human activities, TNC and PT TNK were able to develop eco tourism namely the integration of tourism and environmental protection (no other idea is the same as the eco development), and the welfare of the surrounding community⁷¹. According to the study conducted by Dale, that discourses are not valid at all. For example PT TNK & TNC are claimed to overcome the environmental damage in TNK caused by human activity. Whether humans which is meant by TNC and PT TNK? Because after management handed over to PT TNK & TNC hand, environmental degradation worsening. One of the reasons is from the rubbish dumped by the tourists who visit the KNP⁷². This environmental damage is great blow against the Ecotourism claims raised by TNC and PT TNK.

In addition, beside it did not give any contribution to the environmental sustainability in TNK, in fact, the claims of community empowerment are not proven at all. According to the study Dale, since TNK is managed by TNC and PT TNK, there was no evidence of local residents experiencing economic recovery, it noted they remain below the poverty line from year to year⁷³. The scenery is ironic considering environment conditions inside TNK increasingly damaged over time, but in the same time, the locals do not get any results.

http://2013.aepsustainability.com/fastfacts/reports/docs/AEP_IRR_C_Profile.pdf

⁷⁰ Cypri Jehan Paju Dale. 2013. *Kuasa, Pembangunan, Dan Pemiskinan Sistemik*. Labuhan Baju: Sunspirit Books,p.72

⁷¹ *Ibid*,p. 96

⁷² *Ibid*

⁷³ *Ibid*

A short study on the profile of the actors that were not environmentally friendly must create skepticism on NKCAP as the environmental protection strategy which is really evident. In fact the study carried out by Greenpeace confirm such skepticism. As previously described, NKCAP project is based on exchange strategy, which Bolivia people who perform various activities damaging to the environment will be compensated with the new environmentally friendly economy. In return, the public no longer penetrated the forest, which in essence is able to absorb gas emissions and preserving the diversity of biodiversity. In fact exchange offer is just a lie that inflicts a suffering to Bolivian society.

One such example is revealed by Greenpeace intensive research on local residents who were supposed to get all the facilities needed to perform the micro-economic development of environmentally friendly such as raising animals and bees or ecotourism. It turns out, according to residents; they indeed get the cows that can be used for breeding. But a cows that came from Europe. Surely the European cows do not have the endurance to live in the tropics place, and proved unable to survive in those conditions. Residents wondered why they were given cows from Europe, whereas imported cattle are relatively expensive compared to local cows⁷⁴.

Not only about cows, are various promises to the residents stocked by NKCAP project not realized. Such citizens were promised an increase in region added value with the opening of ecotourism. Actually the idea is a promising idea because Santa Cruz region has exceptional biodiversity. But the promise is merely a promise, in which funding for road building was not flown⁷⁵. It is recorded that funds flowing into the area just enough to repair the tile local school⁷⁶. Of course, these facts are sufficient to show NKCAP project did not provide benefits for local people.

From the above explanation, it is very clear that NKCAP program serves only as a strategy of "branding" of the various corporations that had been getting bad performance in environmental issues. But perhaps the question arises, although in terms of community empowerment is very disappointing, at least there has been a reduction in carbon emissions. So, the affairs of empowerment can be corrected in the future.

⁷⁴ Greenpeace. 2009. *Carbon Scam: Noel Kempff Climate Action Project and the Push for Sub-national Forest Offsets*. Ottho Heldringstraat: Greenpeace International,p. 13

⁷⁵ *Ibid*

⁷⁶ *Ibid*

The answer is certainly not. NKCAP just an attempt to "branding" or "wash" the "dirty hands" of anti-environmental companies such as American Electric Power. So in fact, there is no positive progress in the greenhouse reduction at all.

From NKCAP to (Post) Kyoto (Protocol): *Long Live Capitalism*

Unveiling the dark side of NKCAP actually sufficient to demonstrate REDD + is just an illusion, which is not able to reduce carbon emissions in the Earth's atmosphere. On the other hand REDD + also gives more value to the dirty corporations because it is considered a true solution to global warming. Thus, their sins are vanished. Like the cigarette manufacturers are trying various ways to erase the bad image of them as killers of society (due to the effects of smoking on general users and society as passive smokers). Among examples of the cigarette industry cunning strategies such as providing scholarships to citizens of Indonesia, the provision of special funds to national athletes, even introducing a false historical discourse that cigarette is "the great cultural heritage of Indonesia"

Although the review of NKCAP has actually been sufficient to demonstrate REDD+ as an illusion, but the discussion is not complete if it missed the points of differentiation REDD + with NKCAP. The distinguishing point is REDD + is actually more fierce, authoritarian, and brutal than NKCAP. How it can be? The answer can be seen in the Kyoto Protocol regime legacies which still have the influence to this day, namely flexible mechanism.

In order to understand the CDM scheme, it is worth briefly look at the essence of the Kyoto protocol. In summarizing the content of the Kyoto protocol is applicable strategies to confront global warming. A strategy offered is in the form of carbon emission reductions undertaken by Annex I (consisting of highly industrialized countries). Reduction is done by reducing the use of six types of gases that are considered as the culprit of the greenhouse effect, such as Co2 / carbon dioxide and methane⁷⁷. There is the size specified by the Kyoto Protocol on carbon emissions reduction obligations by Annex I, which is 5% less than the emissions in 1990⁷⁸.

In order to avoid the difficulties of Annex I countries in efforts to reduce their carbon emissions to reach the targets set, the protocol also arrange "alternate path" so-called flexible mechanisms. This mechanism

⁷⁷ WTO & UNEP. 2009. *Trade and Climate Change*. Geneva: WTO Publications, p. 71

⁷⁸ *Ibid*

consists of three different programs i.e. Joint Implementation (JI), Clean Development Mechanism (CDM), and International Emission Trading (IET). These three programs have one thing in common that allow cooperation between one country to another (either individually or collectively) to ensure emission reduction targets required by the Protocol could be a success. The difference in three of the program focuses on the shape and actors cooperation. JI and IET limit cooperation among Annex I countries, while the CDM between Annex I and non-Annex I (third world countries)⁷⁹. Protocols allow Annex I countries can freely choose the most inexpensive manner as to achieve the reduction target⁸⁰.

It is necessary to know that the first round of the expiration of the Kyoto Protocol was in 2012. When Kyoto Protocol regime "is not available" anymore, the idea of REDD+ immediately dominates the global discussion about the most effective way in dealing with global warming. Actually, since the meeting in Bali in 2007, REDD+ was already prepared to be a (not mentioned as the only one) of global warming reduction strategy approved by almost all of the countries in the world⁸¹.

Kyoto protocol regime actually provide great opportunities for industrialized countries (and corporations) to choose the most favorable option for them, but potentially harmful to third world countries. Clean Development Mechanism scheme clearly allows industrialized countries and global corporations continue to produce greenhouse gases in their own country while making the land of others (third world) as their laboratory.

If we pay attention to the post-Kyoto Protocol regime carefully, it actually just continues the strategy that has been initiated by the Kyoto Protocol, namely Clean Development Mechanism⁸². Therefore, it can be said that REDD+ is REDD + is actually more fierce, authoritarian, and

⁷⁹ Pouffary, Cheng C, Svenningsen & Callaway. 2008. *The Kyoto Protocol: The Clean Development Mechanism, and the Building and The Construction Sector*. Paris: UNEP, p. 11

⁸⁰ *Ibid*, p.12

⁸¹ I Gusti Agung Made Wardana. 2012. A Critical Analysis Of Redd+ Legal Architecture In Reducing Emissions From Forestry Sectors In Indonesian. Dalam *INDONESIA Law Review Year 2 Vol. 1*, p. 76

⁸² Keep in mind that the post-Kyoto regime until today, REDD + was never called as part of the Clean Development Mechanism (CDM). But that must be understood that the REDD + is essentially no different from the CDM scheme.

brutal than NKCAP. Since NKCAP is one of the environmental projects undertaken by some global corporations, while REDD+ becomes the only option (dominant) at the time and there is no alternative option. Even countries which are considered not agreeing this idea can be labeled as not pro-environment, selfish, and do not have a global solidarity.

Collaborative Governance and the two sides of REDD + Illusion

After it is clear that REDD+ is a fake solution for global warming countermeasures, the important question to be answered next is that what illusions used which led many people deify REDD+. The answers lie in two types of illusions which are interrelated, like two sides of the coin which are attached to each other. It should be added that the illusion of the existence of the two sides cannot be separated from the idea of collaborative governance, which is the mainstream foothold fundamental to the survival and existence of the REDD+ scheme that requires the cooperation of many parties.

The first illusion, which is in line with the concept of Umberto Eco, is that REDD+ offers a reality that is more "real" compared to other environmental protection options that may be available. REDD + offers a spectacular promise in efforts to save the environment, because REDD + promising environmental improvements in a broad sense and economic benefits in a broad sense as well. It is conceivable that in the context of environmental protection, REDD+ does not just promise a reduction in greenhouse gases that endanger the international community because it triggers the global warming, but also the preservation of the diversity of ecosystems in different parts of the world (especially forests). Of course, for the transnational NGOs activist who pays attention to the preservation of plants and animals are very interested in the offer of the REDD+. The offer would also draw attention to third world countries who actually participated destroy nature, although in a smaller scale than industrialized countries. In a way of REDD+, the preservation of the nature of their countries will remain intact. Obviously with minimal funding because it has been helped in such a way by the REDD+ scheme. Moreover, the opportunity for third world countries to appear at the international stage as the countries which care about the environment. It should be emphasized that only Annex I countries, which have a responsibility to reduce their greenhouse gases, while the third world do not. If the third world countries took part in the reduction of greenhouse gases "voluntarily" will certainly raise the name of the countries in the international arena. In the broader economic context, REDD+ also promises a variety of things which are very "beautiful", ranging from community empowerment through various schemes of environmental friendly micro-economic.

No wonder with such illusions, a third world country like Indonesia is so impressed and becomes one of the countries which "voluntarily" provide the land for the implementation of REDD+⁸³. Indonesia has built a special institution dealing with REDD+ which is called *satgas REDD+* (the task force) in the era of Yudhoyono. Many academicians, environmentalists, pro-environment NGOs ranging from local to international also actively involved in REDD+ projects in Indonesia until today.

In the context of REDD+ illusion by Eco, the collaborative governance plays an important role in order to reinforce the established illusion. It can be likened to a book or a best-seller product in sales. The book will also award as a bestseller. In the context of REDD+, the participation of many possible actors involved is better because it shows that the strategy or scheme is credible. When the credibility is already established, as the book has been labeled a bestseller, it will further strengthen the illusion. For example, in the context of the book, by looking at the label, many people are interested in knowing its contents. The only way is to buy it. In the context of REDD+, there will be more and more actors who want to be involved with the scheme, both in the same area - if there is any economic opportunity - and the initiation in other possible regions or countries. As a domino effect, the more credible (in other words, the stronger illusions) REDD+ over time, the global acceptance of the REDD+ can be maintained.

The second illusion, which is in line with the concept of Baudrillard, is that REDD+ is shown as a not perfect concept. It should be emphasized that the imperfection here does not mean contradictory with Eco argument. Imperfection is that this concept seemed to openly declare "itself" as a something which is very difficult to be implemented in the field. Where is the similarity of this illusion with the idea of Baudrillard? The answer clearly lies in the original scheme of REDD+ which is perceived as stunning in concept but difficult to be implemented in the real world⁸⁴. So it can be said that the idea of REDD+ is "abstract" and "half-fiction". But this illusion does not stop here, where the illusion put the confidence that through the existence of collaborative governance schemes -that is the optimal unification among the actors working- can

⁸³ Concrete examples of how the Indonesian political elite to imagine about REDD+ can be found at Nugroho, Wisnu. 2011. *Rachmat Witoelar Dan Perubahan Iklim*. Jakarta: Kompas, p. 184

⁸⁴ See an example of this view openly in Angelsen, Arild & Stibniati Atmadja (ed). 2010. *Melangkah Maju Dengan REDD Isu, Pilihan Dan Implikasi*. Bogor: CIFOR, p. Ix

attain ideal condition which is imaginable that it can present the idea of REDD+.

The question which may still arise is whether the illusion has the truth. The answer is in accordance with the Eco idea about Disneyland that is a mixture of fact and fiction. Crocodile in nature is exactly the same as what is in Disneyland. But also veiled by fiction, where the crocodile behave more aggressively as imagined and wanted by the visitors compared to what is original in nature.

The most obvious example of this blend of fiction and fact in REDD+, for example, the impressions which are very ambitious in the original scheme which is difficult to be realized, but can be addressed through a collaborative scheme. It is true that the concept of REDD+ may be repaired, but when the process of "transition" will be still happened? Perhaps in a very long phase it will also not be achieved. Ambiguity is certainly very deceptive in the context of global warming countermeasures that require clarity of action, instead of thinking the "half fiction" which has the unclear edges.

Furthermore, in the phase of "transition" towards an imagined ideal that is also the phase of the corporations and advanced industrial countries can continue to dump pollution into the atmosphere freely, because it has "paid" the cost of REDD+. Moreover, unfortunately, when the phase of "ideal" has not been implemented, then the advanced industrial countries and corporations are no longer the only actors who can be blamed for the slow implementation of ideal REDD+. However, the blame also goes to NGOs, communities around the sites, the third world countries, and other actors involved in REDD+. In this context, collaborative governance can be used by corporations and advanced industrial countries as a weapon to reduce the environmental criticism on them, otherwise, redistribute it "fairly" to all of the actors involved in the scheme of collaborative governance of REDD+.

Post Scriptum: Towards a collapse of Sign Value REDD + regime

The study above shows that REDD + is nothing more than fake solution in saving the environment which is still a dominant option since there were two sides of illusions which accompany it. Of course, if such a situation is allowed to drag the destruction of nature and the greater global warming potential poses the more difficult to be controlled. The only available solution is absolutely by replacing the illusion of REDD+ regime with another more promising option in overcoming the climate damage.

Of course, it becomes a question on how to fight such a powerful illusion which "hypnotizes" people of the world until now? The interesting answer, indeed, was already offered by Baurdillard with the

revolution strategy which focuses on "burning" the sign. In order to understand the purpose of Baudrillard's worth examining the first conception of the sign is meant by him.

Baudrillard's conception of the sign refers to the conception which is often termed as the sign value. Sign value itself has a meaning of a good which has a "more" value beyond the intrinsic value of the good itself⁸⁵. The easy example of the stuff by Baudrillard is often witnessed by young people who are "hanging out" in the cafe in which the price of a cup coffee or tea has reached 30,000 to 50,000 rupiah. Whereas, in *angkringan* stalls, the price of a cup of coffee or tea is not more than 2,000 rupiah. The taste is relatively similar. But there are more values in a cup of coffee served at the cafe that makes young people like to "hang out" and spend money in the cafe.

This kind of condition for Baudrillard can only be combated with the sign of the revolution as well, in which the sign has to be "burned" or destroyed altogether. In this context, the insurgency must be done using a similar strategy to the old sign regime. Such gestures then are reciprocated with gestures, slogans met with slogans, etc⁸⁶.

In the context of REDD+, the same solution should be adopted to overthrow the regime of the sign. One model of resistance that pierced the "heart" of REDD+ with a symbolic strategy for example, can be observed in Figure 2.



Source: Astuti, 2013: 88
Picture 2 Anti REDD+ Caricature

⁸⁵ Dagmar, Danko. 2010. Hyperreality and Simulation. In Jackson II, Ronald L. (ed). *Encyclopedia of Identity*. California: SAGE, p. 340

⁸⁶ Call, Lewis. 2002. *Postmodern Anarchism*. Lanham: Lexington Books, p.23

On the image, it implies a very deep meaning which is able to burn the old sign carried by REDD+. Imagine if the carbon is so enthusiastic to be consumed by the third world countries during the REDD+ is actually analogous to fart. How could the third world countries happily inhaling "fart" produced by the advanced industrial countries and global corporations for a very little exchange intrinsically (scraper penny / *uang kerokan*). Even if the third world countries are given money of 100,000 rupiah, with the analogy is very likely to reject it because it is a disgusting thing for them to be "the fart inhaler" of the advanced industrial countries and the corporations.

It should be emphasized that the revolution of anti-illusion of REDD+ does not mean that the third world countries are free to destroy forests in their regions. However, the process of the destruction of meaning that formed the old sign regime should be directed to the roots, so that there is no longer illusion that can be stocked to ensure that the third world countries and other non-state actors who still have a conscience to be the cause of the implementation of the scheme of "fart inhaling".

Bibliography

- Abarrio, Rubén Peinado. (2014) *Learning To Be American: Richard Ford's Frank Bascombe Trilogy and the Construction of A National Identity*. Valencia: Universitat de València
- Andrew E. Dessler. (2005) *The Economics of Climate Change: Evidence*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Angelsen, Arild and Stibniati Atmadja. (2010) *Buku ini tentang apa?.* In: Angelsen, Arild and Stibniati Atmadja (eds). *Melangkah Maju Dengan REDD Isu, Pilihan Dan Implikasi*. Bogor Barat: CIFOR.
- Astuti, Rini. (2013) REDD+ sebagai Strategi-Strategi Kepengaturan Dalam Tata Kelola Hutan di Indonesia: Sebuah Perspektif Foucauldian. *Wacana* 25(30).
- Call, Lewis. (2002) *Postmodern Anarchism*. Lanham: Lexington Books.
- Casper, Julie Kerr. (2010) *Greenhouse Gases: Worldwide Impacts*. New York: Fact on File, Inc.
- Cecilia Van Zyl & Godwell Nhamo. (2011) Financing REDD+ in Africa. In: Nhamo, Godwell (ed). *Green Economy and Climate Mitigation: Topics of Relevance to Africa*. Pretoria: Africa Institute of South Africa.
- Chapbell, Neil. (2005) Producing America: Redefining Post-Tourism in Global Media Age. In: Crouch, David, Rhona Jackson and Felix Thompson (eds). *The Media and the Tourist Imagination: Converging Cultures*. Abingdon: Routledge.

- Chandrappa, R., Gupta, S. and Kulshrestha, U. C.. (2011) *Coping with Climate Change: Principles and Asian Context*. Heidelberg: Springer.
- Clowney, David & Patricia Mosto (ed). (2009) *Earthcare: An Anthology in Environmental Ethics*. Lanham: Rowman & Littlefield.
- Cooper, C. David. (2015) *Introduction to Environmental Engineering*. Long Grove, IL: Waveland Press.
- Cottle, Phil & Charles Crostwaite Eyre. (2002) Insuring Forest Sinks. In Bishop, Joshua & Stefano Pagiola (ed). *Selling Forest Environmental Services: Market-Based Mechanisms for Conservation and Development*. Abingdon: EarthScan.
- Cronon, William. (2008) Silent Spring and The Birth of Modern Environmentalism. In Dunlap, Thomas R (ed). (2008) *DDT, Silent Spring, and the Rise of Environmentalism: Classic Texts*. Seattle: University of Washington Press.
- Cumo, Christopher. (2015) DDT. In: Ryan, James Gilbert and Leonard C Schlup (eds). *Historical Dictionary of the 1940s*. New York: Routledge.
- Cypri Jehan Paju Dale. (2013) *Kuasa, Pembangunan, Dan Pemiskinan Sistemik*. Labuhan Baju: Sunspirit Books.
- Dagmar, Danko. (2010) Hyperreality and Simulation. In Jackson II, Ronald L. (ed). *Encyclopedia of Identity*. California: SAGE.
- Davis, Frederick Rowe. (2014) *Banned: A History of Pesticides and the Science of Toxicology*. London: Yale University Press.
- Derr, Patrick George & Edward M. McNamara. (2003) *Case Studies in Environmental Ethics*. Rowman & Littlefield Publishing Group, Inc.
- Dodds, Felix, Michael Strauss & Maurice F. Strong. (2012) *Only One Earth: The Long Road via Rio to Sustainable Development*. Abingdon: Routledge.
- Doyle, Julie. (2011) *Mediating Climate Change*. England: Asghate.
- Eco, Umberto. (1986) *Travels in Hyperreality*. Florida: Houghton Mifflin Harcourt.
- English, Mary E. (2004) Environment Risk and Justice. Dalam McDaniels, Timothy & Mitchell Small (ed). *Risk Analysis and Society: An Interdisciplinary Characterization of the Field*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Free the Slaves and Human Right Center. (2004) *HIDDEN SLAVES Forced Labor in the United States*. Washington, D.C & Berkeley: di Free the Slaves& Human Right Center.
- GEF and UNCCD. (2011) *Land for Life: Securing Our Common Future*. Washington D.C: Global Environment Facility.

- Glover, Leigh(2006) *Postmodern Climate Change*. New York: Routledge.
- Goodell, Jeff. (2006) *Big Coal: The Dirty Secret Behind America's Energy Future*. New York: Houghton Mifflin Harcourt.
- Greenpeace. (2009) *Carbon Scam: Noel Kempff Climate Action Project and the Push for Sub-national Forest Offsets*. Ottho Heldringstraat: Greenpeace International.
- Housel, Debra J. (2008) *Pioneering Ecologists*. Huntington Beach, CA: Teacher Created Materials Publishing.
- Investor Responsibility Research Center. (2004) *Profile on American Electric Power*. pp. 7. [Online] Available from http://2013.aepsustainability.com/fastfacts/reports/docs/AEP_IRRC_Profile.pdf.
- Joseph, Benny. (2006) *Environmental Studies*. Delhi: Tata Mc Graw Hill.
- Julier, Guy. (200) *The Culture of Design*. London: SAGE.
- Kamieniecki, Sheldon. (1993) Emerging Forces in Global Environmental Politics. In Kamieniecki, Sheldon (ed). *Environmental Politics in the International Arena: Movements, Parties, Organizations, and Policy*. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press.
- Kolas, Ashild. (2008) *Tourism and Tibetan Culture in Transition: A Place Called Shangrila*. Abingdon: Routledge.
- Kusky, Timothy M. (2009) *Climate Change: Shifting Glaciers, Deserts, and Climate Belts*. New York: Facts on File, Inc.
- Lane, Richard J. (2009) *Jean Baudrillard*. Abingdon: Routledge.
- Lanser, Amanda. (2015) *Adapting to Climate Change*. Minneapolis: ABDO Publishing.
- Lenhard, Johannes. (2011) *Hyperreal Obscenities - Baudrillard on Cybersex*. Norderstedt: GRIN Verlag.
- Leydier, Gilles and Martin, Alexia. (2013) Introduction. In: Leydier, Gilles and Martin, Alexia (eds). *Environmental Issues in Political Discourse in Britain and Ireland*. Newcastle Upon Tyne: Cambridge University Press.
- Lister, Martin *et al.* (2009) *New Media: A Critical Introduction*. Abingdon: Routledge.
- Makfoeld, Djarir et al. (2002) *Kamus Istilah Pangan Dan Nutrisi*. Yogyakarta: Kanisius.
- Mast, Jerald and Carthage College. (2011) International Environmental Politics In Ishiyama, John T & Marijke Breuning (ed). *21st Century Political Science: A Reference Handbook Volume 1*. California: SAGE.
- Moore, Colleen F. (2003) *Silent Scourge: Children, Pollution, and Why Scientists Disagree*. New York: Oxford.

- Moore, Colleen F. (2009) *Children and Pollution: Why Scientists Disagree*. New York: Oxford
- Morris, David B. (1998) *Illness and Culture in the Postmodern Age*. London: University of California Press.
- National Research Council. No year. *Informing an Effective Response to Climate Change*. Washington D.C: National Academies Press.
- Norris, Trevor. (2011) *Consuming Schools: Commercialism and the End of Politics*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
- Nugroho, Wisnu. (2011) *Rachmat Witoelar Dan Perubahan Iklim*. Jakarta: Kompas.
- OECD. (2015) *Development Co-operation Report 2015: Making Partnerships Effective Coalitions for Action*. Paris: OECD Publishing.
- Palmer, Clare. Sustainability and Philosophy. In: Blewitt, John and Cedric Cullingford (eds). *The Sustainability Curriculum: The Challenge for Higher Education*. London: Earthscan
- Pandya, Rameshwari. (2010) Introduction. In: Pandya, Rameshwari (ed). *Adult and Non Formal Education*. New Delhi: Gyan Publishing House.
- Petersen, Christine. (2011) *Protecting Earth's Food Supply*. Singapore: Marshal Candevish Corporation.
- Pouffary, Cheng C, Svenningsen and Callaway. (2008) *The Kyoto Protocol: The Clean Development Mechanism, and the Building and The Construction Sector*. Paris: UNEP.
- Rashid, Muhammad H. (2015) *Alternative Energy in Power Electronics*. Oxford: Butterworth-Heinemann.
- Richardson, Dick. (1995) The Green Challenge: Philosophical, Programmatic, and Electoral Considerations. In: Richardson, Dick & Chris Rootes (ed). *The Green Challenge: The Development of Green Parties in Europe*. London: Routledge.
- Robertson, Nina & Wunder, Sven. (2005) *Fresh Tracks in the Forest: Assessing Incipient Payments for Environmental Services Initiatives in Bolivia*. Jakarta: CIFOR.
- Rubenstein, Diane. (2010) America. In: Smith, Richard G. (ed). *The Baudrillard Dictionary*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.
- Salecl, Renata. No year. The State as A Work of Art: The Trauma of Ceausescu's Disneyland. In: Leach, Neil (ed). *Architecture and Revolution: Contemporary Perspectives on Central and Eastern Europe*. London: Routledge.
- Saleh-Hanna, Viviane. (2008). *Colonial Systems of Control: Criminal Justice in Nigeria*. Ottawa: University of Ottawa Press.
- Salih, M.A. Mohamed. (2013) Conclusion. In: Salih, M.A. Mohamed (ed.). *Local Climate Change and Society*. Abingdon: Routledge.

- Silvia. (2014) *8 Holiday Attractions for Kids at The Disneyland Resort*. [Online] Available from <http://www.mamalatinatips.com/2014/11/8-holiday-attractions-for-kids-at-the-disneyland-resort.html>.
- Tolo, Emilianus Yakob Sese. (2012) Signifikansi Desentralisasi Kehutanan Bagi Implementasi REDD+ di Kabupaten Maluku Tengah. In *Jurnal Ilmu Sosial dan Ilmu Politik*, 16(2).
- Trexler, M, L. Kosloff & R. Gibbons. (1999) Overview of Forestry and land Use Projects Pursued under the Pilot. In: Dixon, Robert K. (ed). *The U.N. Framework Convention on Climate Change Activities Implemented Jointly (AJI) Pilot: Experiences and Lesson Learned*. Dordrecht: Springer.
- Wardana, I Gusti Agung Made. (2012) A Critical Analysis Of Redd+ Legal Architecture In Reducing Emissions From Forestry Sectors In Indonesian. *Indonesia Law Review*. Year 2 Vol. 1.
- WTO & UNEP. (2009) *Trade and Climate Change*. Geneva: WTO Publications.